



A COMPARATIVE ANALYSIS ON TRANSLATION STRATEGIES IN THE BAHASA INDONESIA AND TOBA BATAKNESE CHRISTIAN HYMNS

Rafita Tioria Sianipar^{1*}, Meisuri², I Wayan Dirgayasa Tangkas³,
Winda Setiasari⁴, Semaria Eva Elita Girsang⁵

¹Institut Agama Kristen Negeri Tarutung

²Universitas Negeri Medan

³Universitas Simalungun

⁴STKIP Budidaya

Email: fitasianipar@gmail.com, meisuriw@yahoo.com, wayandirgayasa@yahoo.com,
windasetiasari@unimed.ac.id, semariagirsang.eg@gmail.com

Abstract:

This paper aims to examine and compare the translation strategies employed in the translation of originally written in English hymns into Indonesian and Toba Batak languages, and to identify commonalities and disparities in translation approaches, by using Peter Low's strategy of song translation, i.e the translation, adaptation, and replacement. The data consists of a collection of hymns in English and their respective translations in Indonesian and Toba Batak. The results of data analysis discovered that adaptation was the most frequently used strategy in both Indonesian and Toba Batak translations. In addition, replacement strategy applied in the two target languages was also notable. The findings further indicate a consistent translation choice of the term "Saviour" as "Jesus" in both Indonesian and Toba Batak translations, suggesting that the cultural context of the target language influences the strategy chosen by translators.

Keywords: *hymn translation, Indonesian language, Toba Batak language*

Abstrak:

Penelitian ini bertujuan untuk menganalisa dan membandingkan strategi terjemahan dalam kidung pujian Kristiani, dari lirik Bahasa Inggris ke bahasa Indonesia dan Batak Toba, dengan menggunakan teori strategi menerjemahkan lagu oleh Peter Low, yakni *translation*, *adaptation*, dan *replacement*. Data penelitian berupa lirik dari beberapa lagu kidung pujian dalam bahasa Inggris beserta lirik lagu terjemahannya dalam bahasa Indonesia dan Batak Toba. Hasil data analisis menunjukkan bahwa *adaptation* adalah strategi yang paling banyak digunakan dalam menerjemahkan kidung pujian dari bahasa Inggris ke dalam bahasa Indonesia dan Batak Toba. Selain itu, penerapan strategi *replacement* juga menarik perhatian dalam kedua bahasa target. Lebih jauh, dari temuan penelitian diketahui bahwa terjemahan *Saviour* menjadi *Jesus* dalam kedua bahasa target mengindikasikan bahwa konteks kultur mempengaruhi para penerjemah dalam memilih strategi terjemahan yang dirasa paling tepat dalam menerjemahkan kidung ke dalam bahasa Indonesia dan Batak Toba.

Kata kunci: bahasa Indonesia, bahasa Batak Toba, terjemahan kidung pujian

41| Korespondensi mengenai artikel dapat dilakukan kepada:

*Rafita Tioria Sianipar, Institut Agama Kristen Negeri Tarutung, Tapanuli Utara (22452), Indonesia

Email: fitasianipar@gmail.com



INTRODUCTION

Hymns hold a significant place in religious worship, serving as powerful expressions of faith, spirituality, and cultural heritage (see Tedeschi, 2019). As hymns travel across different languages and cultures, they undergo the intricate process of translation, where the challenge lies in preserving the essence and meaning of the original text while adapting it to resonate with the linguistic and cultural nuances of the target language (Ilomo, 2021; Peck, 2022). Hymns, with their profound religious and cultural significance, have been cherished by communities around the world for centuries. Since hymns are translated from their original language into various target languages, the challenge of preserving their lyrical beauty and spiritual essence becomes apparent. However, the task extends beyond mere translation; it involves ensuring that the translated hymns can still be sung with the same melody and rhythm as the original songs. In other words, borrowing the terminology of Low (2008), the challenge faced by translators is to create a "singable translation."

Hymns have been translated into various languages worldwide, including both national and local languages (see Pluth, 2013; Kloppers, 2017; Arrington, 2021; Peck, 2022). Two of these languages are Indonesian and Batak Toba. The collection of translated hymns in Indonesian is known as *Kidung Jemaat* (songs of the congregations), while the collection in Batak Toba is called *Buku Ende* (book of songs). Therefore, this research aims to examine the translation strategies employed in translating hymns from English to Indonesian and Batak Toba. These two languages have distinct cultural and linguistic backgrounds. The analysis of data will be based on the translation strategy theory by Peter Low (2005; 2013; 2017).

According to Low (2013), when a song is rendered into another language, it can be classified as a translation, an adaptation, or a replacement. In the case of a translation (henceforth written as TT), the words of the song in the target language closely convey the significant details of meaning from the original language. On the other hand, an adaptation is a modified version where certain significant details of meaning are not transferred, even though they could have been. Meanwhile, a 'replacement text' refers to a completely new set of lyrics created to be sung to an



existing melody. These replacement texts lack any semantic or syntactic fidelity to the source text, as they are newly devised compositions (Low, 2013).

Hymn translation is a complex field that has attracted the attention of scholars in translation studies, religious studies, and linguistics. The process of translating hymns involves not only linguistic considerations but also cultural, religious, and musical aspects. Previous studies have explored various aspects of hymn translation, providing valuable insights into the challenges and strategies employed by translators in transferring the religious and emotional essence of hymns from one language to another.

Pluth's (2013) study focuses on the *Liber Hymnarius*, which is the only official hymnbook in the Latin Rite where numerous hymns remain untranslated. The research suggests that the challenges in the translation process are difficult but worth overcoming to help contemporary Catholics feel connected to their predecessors in earlier centuries. Similarly, Arrington's (2021) study examines the transformation of original Western hymns when "translated" by the Lisu people, indicating that the translated hymns underwent a transformation rather than a direct translation. Ilomo's (2021) study investigates the challenges faced by the Berlin Missionaries in translating hymns for the Kinga people in Southern Tanzania, highlighting the complexity of hymn translation due to the nuances and cultural connotations of words. Peck's (2022) research explores prosodic modeling for hymn translation, aiming to develop a comprehensive prosody model to guide the alignment of prosodic features. The findings suggest that while the primary focus is hymn translation, the models also contribute theoretical insights into prosody. Finally, Purba and Setiasari (2022) conducted a study on the prevalent translation methods employed in translating English hymn songs into Indonesian in the hymnal "*Kidung Jemaat*." Their findings reveal the existence of three distinct translation methods, with adaptation being the most commonly used approach by the translators.

While existing studies have provided valuable insights into hymn translation in specific languages and cultural contexts, limited research has focused on the comparison of translation strategies employed in different languages. This study aims to bridge this gap by analyzing and comparing hymn translations in Indonesian and



Batak Toba, shedding light on the similarities and differences in translation practices within these two languages. By building upon the existing literature on hymn translation and incorporating the findings from previous studies, this research contributes to the growing body of knowledge in the field of translation studies, highlighting the complexities and challenges of transferring religious and cultural meaning in hymn translations. The analysis of Indonesian and Batak Toba hymns provides a unique opportunity to explore the impact of linguistic and cultural factors on translation choices and offers valuable insights into the strategies employed by translators in conveying the spiritual and emotional essence of hymns.

The research objectives are to examine and compare the translation strategies employed in both versions in order to identify commonalities and disparities in translation approaches. By examining the similarities and differences in translation strategies employed in these two languages, a comprehensive understanding of the translation process and its impact on the transmission of religious and cultural values can be achieved.

METHODOLOGY

The current study adopts a descriptive qualitative research methodology, focusing on a comparative analysis of the translation strategies employed in the Bahasa Indonesia and Toba Batakese renditions of Christian hymns. The primary objective of this investigation is to examine and compare the translation strategies employed in both versions in order to identify commonalities and disparities in translation approaches. Data for this research will be gathered from English, Bahasa Indonesia (known as *Kidung Jemaat*), and Toba Batakese (known as *Buku Ende*) Christian hymnals. A purposive sampling technique will be employed to select hymns and their corresponding translations in both Bahasa Indonesia and Toba Batak languages for comparative analysis. The selection of hymns will be representative of three distinct categories: The Saviour's Calling, Confession and Forgiveness of Sins, and The Birth of Jesus and the Christmas Season. Each category will be represented by two carefully chosen songs, i.e. the hymns which are most frequently sung at churches in both languages. Following table shows the list of hymn titles which are taken as the sample of this research.



Table 1. List of hymns selected in this study

Categories	Titles of the hymns		
	English	Indonesian	Toba Bataknese
The Saviour's Calling	<i>Come to The Saviour</i> (written by George Frederick Root in 1895)	<i>Yesus Memanggil</i> (from <i>Kidung Jemaat</i> No. 355, translated by the Indonesian Church Music Foundation or commonly known as Yamuger in 1979)	<i>Ro Ma tu Jesus</i> (from <i>Buku Ende</i> No. 178)
	<i>Softly and Tenderly</i> (written by Will L. Thompson in 1880)	<i>Sungguh Lembut Tuhan Yesus Memanggil</i> (from <i>Kidung Jemaat</i> No. 353, translated by Yamuger in 1977)	<i>Mansai Lambok</i> (from <i>Buku Ende</i> No. 677)
Confession and Forgiveness of Sins	<i>Rock of Ages</i> (written by Augustus Montague Toplady in 1775)	<i>Batu Karang Yang Teguh</i> (from <i>Kidung Jemaat</i> No. 37, translated by Yamuger in 1985)	<i>Batu Mamak di Au On</i> (from <i>Buku Ende</i> No. 425)
	<i>Pass Me Not, O Gentle Saviour</i> (written Fanny J. Crosby in 1868)	<i>Mampirlah Dengar Doaku</i> (from <i>Kidung Jemaat</i> No. 26, translated by E. L. Pohan Shn. in 1975)	<i>Dulo Ma Au on O Tuhan</i> (from <i>Buku Ende</i> No. 733)
The Birth of Jesus and the Christmas Season	<i>O Come All Ye Faithful</i> (written John Francis Wade in 1751)	<i>Hai Mari Berhimpun</i> (from <i>Kidung Jemaat</i> No. 109, translated by Yamuger in 1980)	<i>Sai Ro Ma Hamuna</i> (from <i>Buku Ende</i> No. 56)
	<i>Hark! The Herald Angels Sing</i> (written Charles Wesley in 1739)	<i>Gita Sorga Bergema</i> (from <i>Kidung Jemaat</i> No. 99, translated by Yamuger in 1977)	<i>Bege Ende ni Suruan</i> (from <i>Buku Ende</i> No. 598)

The data analysis process will entail a meticulous examination of the translated hymns to identify the translation strategies employed in each language. The analysis will be guided by Peter Low's translation strategies (2005; 2013; 2017), which classify translation techniques into three main categories: translation, adaptation, and replacement. Given that this study relies on published materials and does not involve human subjects, ethical concerns are not applicable. However, the researchers will diligently ensure that all sources used are appropriately cited and acknowledged in accordance with scholarly standards.



RESULTS

Translation Strategies Applied In Translated Hymns

1. English-Indonesian translated hymns

From the data analysis, it was found that all the three translation strategies proposed by Low are applied in the Indonesian translated hymns, i.e. the translation (TT), adaptation, and replacement. Following is the distribution of the three strategies discovered in the six Indonesian hymns which were translated from the original English lyrics.

Tabel 2. Distribution of the three strategies of translation as proposed by Low (2005; 2013; 2017) in Indonesian translated hymns

Category	Title	TT		Adaptation		Replacement		Total	
		F	%	F	%	F	%	Ver-ses	%
The Saviour's Calling	<i>Yesus Memanggil</i>	1	12,5	6	75	1	12,5	8	100
	<i>Sungguh Lembut Tuhan Yesus Memanggil</i>	5	62,5	3	37,5	0	0	8	100
Confession and Forgiveness of Sins	<i>Batu Karang Yang Teguh</i>	0	0	2	33,3	4	66,7	6	100
	<i>Mampirlah Dengar Doaku</i>	4	50	3	37,5	1	12,5	8	100
The Birth of Jesus and the Christmas Season	<i>Hai Mari Berhimpun</i>	3	42,9	4	57,1	0	0	7	100
	<i>Gita Sorga Bergema</i>	2	20	5	50	3	30	10	100
Total frequency of each strategy		15	31,9	23	49	9	19,1	47	100

Note: F = Frequency % = Percentage

From the table above, it is evident that among the three types of translation strategies formulated by Low (2005; 2013; 2017), the most frequently observed type of translation is adaptation, occurring 23 times out of a total of 47 song verses, representing a proportion of 49%. Following adaptation is the strategy of literal translation (TT), appearing 15 times or accounting for 31.9%. Finally, the least commonly employed strategy is replacement, with a proportion of 9 occurrences, equivalent to 19.1%.

It is notable that the occurrence proportions of each strategy differ across categories and songs. For instance, in the category "The Birth of Jesus and Christmas



Season," adaptation is the most prevalent strategy, whereas in the category "Confession and Forgiveness of Sins," replacement and TT are the most frequently employed strategies for each respective hymn. Meanwhile, in the category "The Saviour's Calling," TT and adaptation are the strategies most commonly utilized. Nevertheless, based on the overall analysis of the entire set of song verses, it can be concluded that when translating hymns from English to Indonesian, translators predominantly employ the adaptation translation strategy.

a. The TT Strategy in Indonesian hymns

The data analysis results indicate that the TT strategy occurs in 31.9% of the translation process for hymns from English to Indonesian. Although it is not the most frequently employed strategy, its usage is considered quite substantial. Particularly in the songs "Softly and Tenderly/*Sungguh Lembut Tuhan Yesus Memanggil*" and "Pass Me Not, O Gentle Savior/*Mampirlah Dengar Doaku*," this strategy is the most commonly utilized by translators.

Here are examples of the translation process through the TT strategy employed by translators, extracted from the analysis of the song "Softly and Tenderly/*Sungguh Lembut Tuhan Yesus Memanggil*."

Table 3. Examples of the translation process through the translation (TT) strategy from English into Indonesian hymn

No.	Source Text	Literal Translation in Target Language	Translated Lyrics in Target Language
1.	Softly and tenderly Jesus is calling,	<i>Dengan halus dan dengan lembut Tuhan Yesus sedang memanggil</i>	Sungguh lembut Tuhan Yesus memanggil,
2.	Calling for you and for me;	<i>Memanggil kau dan aku</i>	memanggil aku dan kau.
3.	Come home, come home,	<i>Pulanglah, pulanglah (datanglah ke rumah, datanglah ke rumah)</i>	Hai, mari datanglah
4.	Ye who are weary, come home;	<i>Kau yang lelah, pulanglah (datanglah ke rumah)</i>	Kau yang lelah, mari datanglah
5.	Earnestly, tenderly, Jesus is calling,	<i>Dengan sungguh-sungguh, dengan lembut, Tuhan Yesus sedang memanggil</i>	Sungguh lembut Tuhan Yesus memanggil

In terms of sentence structure, the translation may not be exactly identical. However, comparing the literal translation and the translated lyrics, it can be observed that in the translation process, all significant details from the original English lyrics



have been transferred to the translated lyrics in Indonesian. For example, in sentence number 3, the phrase "come home" literally means "*pulang*" in Indonesian. However, in a literal sense, the word "come" implies an invitation to come (in this context, an invitation to come home or to come before the Lord). Therefore, the translation result of "come home" as "*hai, mari datanglah*" can be categorized as an outcome of the TT strategy. As for other sentences, it is evident that there are no significant differences between the literal meaning of the source text and the translation result, which represents the official hymn lyrics in Indonesian.

b. The Adaptation Strategy in Indonesian hymns

The adaptation strategy is the most commonly employed by translators when translating hymns from English to Indonesian. The data analysis results indicate that 49% of hymn translations from English to Indonesian are carried out through the adaptation translation strategy. In this strategy, important details of the meaning are not transferred, although they could have been easily transferred. Here is an example of lyrics translation that has undergone the adaptation process, taken from the song that extensively utilizes this strategy based on the analysis, namely "Come to The Saviour/Yesus Memanggil."

Table 4. Examples of the translation process through the adaptation strategy from English into Indonesian hymn

No.	Source Text	Literal Translation in Target Language	Translated Lyrics in Target Language
1.	Come to The Savior, make no delay	<i>Datanglah kepada Juruselamat, jangan ada penundaan</i>	Yesus memanggil "Mari seg'ra!"
2.	Here in His word He's shown us the way	<i>Di sini dalam Firman-Nya Dia telah menunjukkan kita jalan</i>	Ikutlah jalan selamat baka
3.	Tenderly saying, "Come!"	<i>Dengan lembut berkata "Datanglah!"</i>	Hai marilah seg'ra
4.	Joyful, joyful will the meeting be	<i>Senang, akan senanglah pertemuan nanti</i>	Sungguh nanti kita kan senang
5.	When from sin our hearts are pure and free	<i>Ketika dari dosa hati kita suci dan bebas</i>	Bebas dosa hati pun tentram
6.	And we shall gather, Savior, with Thee	<i>Dan kita akan berkumpul, Juruselamat, bersama-Mu</i>	Bersama Yesus dalam terang



It is evident from the table that the literal meaning and translated lyrics of the source text indeed differ in terms of structure and word choices. However, the conveyed meaning in both the literal meaning and the translated lyrics remains the same. For example, in the lyrics of sentence number 1, the phrase "Come to The Saviour" has a literal meaning of "datanglah kepada Juruselamat." However, the word "datanglah" carries the same essence as "memanggil" (calling), implying that when someone asks us to come, it is synonymous with that person calling us. Additionally, the term "Saviour" in Christianity correlates specifically with Jesus, and "make no delay," although it literally means "jangan ada penundaan" (don't delay), conveys the same meaning as "mari segera" (come quickly). In the other sentences, it is also evident that the translated lyrics in Indonesian still incorporate several words from the literal meaning, serving as keywords or the core meaning of the song verses. Therefore, these translated sentences can be categorized within the adaptation strategy.

c. The Replacement Strategy in Indonesian hymns

The data analysis results indicate that the replacement strategy, where the translation result significantly differs from the literal meaning of the original text, is the least frequently employed strategy by translators when translating hymns from English to Indonesian. It is noted that only 19.1% of the sampled song verses in this study were translated using the replacement strategy. However, in the song titled "Rock of Ages," 75% of the Indonesian lyrics are replacements of the original lyrics, as depicted in the following table.

Table 5. Examples of the translation process through the replacement strategy from English into Indonesian hymn

No.	Source Text	Literal Translation in Target Language	Translated Lyrics in Target Language
1.	Let the water and the blood,	<i>Biarkan air dan darah</i>	Karena dosaku berat
2.	From Thy riven side which flowed,	<i>Dari sisi-Mu yang terbelah yang mengalir</i>	Dan kuasanya menyesak
3.	Be of sin the double cure,	<i>Menjadi pengobat ganda dari dosa</i>	Oh bersihkan diriku
4.	Save me from its guilt and power.	<i>Menyelamatkanku dari rasa bersalah dan kuasanya.</i>	Oleh darah lambungMu

From the table above, it is evident that the literal meaning is significantly different from the translated lyrics. None of the words from the literal meaning are



retained in the translated lyrics; instead, they are replaced with entirely new sentences that convey a different meaning from the original text. For example, in sentence number 1, the original lyrics "Let the water and the blood" are translated as "*Karena Dosaku Berat*" (because my sins are heavy), where these two meanings have no correlation or overlap whatsoever. This phenomenon is observed in the other sentences as well, which is why all of these sentences fall under the replacement strategy.

English-Toba Batakese Translated Hymns

Similar to the translation of Indonesian hymns, the data analysis results reveal that the three translation strategies proposed by Peter Low, namely TT, adaptation, and replacement, are also employed by translators when translating original English hymns into the Batak Toba language. The table below presents the distribution of these three strategies across six sampled hymns in this research.

Tabel 6. Distribution of the three strategies of translation as proposed by Low (2005) in Toba Batakese translated hymns

Category	Title	TT		Adaptation		Replacement		Total	
		F	%	F	%	F	%	Ver- ses	%
The Saviour's Calling	<i>Ro Ma tu Jesus</i>	1	12,5	3	37,5	4	50	8	100
	<i>Mansai Lambok</i>	6	75	1	12,5	1	12,5	8	100
Confession and Forgiveness of Sins	<i>Batu Mamak di Au On</i>	1	16,7	3	50	2	33,3	6	100
	<i>Dulo Ma Au on O Tuhan</i>	2	25	6	75	0	0	8	100
The Birth of Jesus and the Christmas Season	<i>Sai Ro Ma Hamuna</i>	2	28,6	2	28,6	3	42,8	7	100
	<i>Bege Ende ni Suruan</i>	1	10	4	40	5	50	10	100
Total frequency of each strategy		13	27,7	19	40,4	15	31,9	47	100

Note: F = Frequency % = Percentage

From the table above, it is evident that the most commonly employed translation strategy is adaptation, accounting for 40.4% of the occurrences, followed by replacement with a frequency of 31.9%, and lastly, TT with 27.7%.



The distribution of each strategy within each category also varies. In the category "The Saviour's Calling," the dominant strategies are replacement and TT, while in the category "Confession and Forgiveness of Sins," adaptation is the most frequently used strategy. Additionally, in the category "The Birth of Jesus and Christmas Season," both replacement and adaptation strategies occur most frequently. Overall, the results of the analysis indicate that translators of Batak Toba hymns more commonly employ the adaptation strategy.

a. The TT Strategy in Toba Batakese hymns

In contrast to the translated hymns in Indonesian, the analysis results of Batak Toba translated hymns reveal that the TT strategy is the least frequently used by translators, accounting for only 27.7% of the 47 analyzed verses in this study. Here is an example of the TT strategy employed by translators in the Batak Toba hymn, taken from the song "O Come All Ye Faithful/*Sai Ro Ma Hamuna*."

Table 7. Examples of the translation process through the translation (TT) strategy from English into Toba Batakese hymn

No.	Source Text	Literal Translation in Target Language	Translated Lyrics in Target Language
1.	O come ye, O come ye to Bethlehem	<i>Ro ma hamu, ro ma hamu tu Betlehem</i>	Sai ro ma hamuna tu Betlehem.
2.	O come, let us adore Him	<i>Ro ma, tasomba ma Ibane</i>	Tasomba ma Ibane

The above analysis results indicate that there is no significant difference between the translated literal meaning from the source text and the translated lyrics in Batak language. Therefore, both of these sentences are classified under the TT strategy.

b. The Adaptation Strategy in Toba Batakese hymns

Surprisingly, the adaptation strategy is also the most commonly used by translators when translating hymns from English to Batak Toba language, accounting for 40.4% of the occurrences. Here is an example of the adaptation strategy in a Batak Toba translated hymn, taken from the analysis of the song "Pass Me Not, O Gentle Saviour/*Dulo Ma Au On O Tuhan*."



Table 8. Examples of the translation process through the adaptation strategy from English into Toba Batakese hymn

No.	Source Text	Literal Translation in Target Language	Translated Lyrics in Target Language
1.	Pass me not, O Gentle Saviour	<i>Unang bolusi au, O Sipalua na Lambok</i>	Dulo ma au on o Tuhan,
2.	While on others Thou art calling	<i>Alai tu angka halak manjou do Ho</i>	Ro do Ho tu angka dongan,
3.	Do not pass me by	<i>Unang bolusi au</i>	topot ma au on.
4.	Saviour, Saviour	<i>Sipalua, Sipalua</i>	Jesus Tuhan,
5.	While on others Thou art calling	<i>Alai tu angka halak manjou do Ho</i>	Ro do Ho tu angka dongan
6.	Do not pass me by	<i>Unang bolusi au</i>	topot ma au on.

For those who do not speak the Batak language, the lyrics in the examples above may appear more like replacements rather than adaptations, as there seems to be a minimal transfer of words from the literal meaning to the translated lyrics. However, this is not the case. Despite the apparent differences, the core or meaning of the source text in its literal sense has been semantically incorporated into the translated lyrics. For instance, in sentence number 1, the literal meaning of "Pass Me Not" is "*Unang Bolusi Au*" in the Batak language. However, the translation "*Dulo Ma Au*," which means "take a look at me," carries the same meaning, which is a plea for God not to pass by the poet (the lyricist) but to pay attention and see the poet. Similarly, the phrase "*Sipalua Na Lambok*" as the literal meaning of "O Gentle Saviour" carries the same meaning as "*Tuhan*" (God), as in Christianity, the term "Saviour" correlates specifically with God (Jesus Christ). This pattern applies to other translated sentences as well, thus classifying them under the adaptation strategy.

c. The Replacement Strategy in Toba Batakese hymns

In Batak Toba hymns, consistent with the data analysis results, the replacement strategy is the second most frequently used strategy by translators to convey the meaning of hymns from English to Batak Toba language, accounting for 31.9% of the overall data. Below are examples of the identified replacement strategy from the song "Hark! The Herald Angels Sing/*Bege Ende Ni Suruan*."

Table 9. Examples of the translation process through the replacement strategy from English into Toba Batakese hymn



No.	Source Text	Literal Translation in Target Language	Translated Lyrics in Target Language
1.	Peace on earth and mercy mild	<i>Dame ma di portibi jala pasu-pasu mansai lambok</i>	Nunga tubu Sipalua
2.	God and sinners reconciled"	<i>Debata dohot pardosa mardame</i>	Raja Sipardame i,
3.	Joyful all ye nations rise	<i>Mariaria ma hamu angka bangso</i>	Dipadame Debatanta
4.	Join the triumph of the skies	<i>Ihuthon ma riarina na di langit i</i>	do diriNa tu pardosa
5.	With angelic host proclaim	<i>Dohot suru-suruan mambaritahon</i>	Nunga tubu Kristus i

From the table above, it is evident that the literal meaning differs significantly from the translated lyrics. For instance, in sentence number 1, the phrase "Peace on earth and mercy mild" in its literal form in Batak language is "*Dame ma di portibi jala pasu-pasu mansai lambok*," but in the Batak Toba hymn, it is translated as "*Nunga Tubu Sipalua*," which means "The Saviour is born." These two sentences have no correlated meaning whatsoever. The same applies to the other sentences, hence categorizing them under the replacement strategy.

The similarities and/or differences between the Indonesian and Toba Bataknese translated hymns

1. Similarities

Based on the analysis of the data, the most prominent similarity between the translated hymns in Indonesian and Batak Toba is the dominant translation strategy: adaptation. The adaptation strategy proves to be the most suitable approach for the translators, both in Indonesian and Batak languages, to convey the meaning of the songs from English into these two languages.

Another similarity found is the tendency of the translators to translate the word "Saviour" as "Jesus," both in the Indonesian and Batak Toba hymns. There are at least two songs that exemplify this, namely "Come to The Saviour/Yesus Memanggil/Ro Ma Tu Jesus" and "Pass Me Not, O Gentle Saviour/Mampirlah Dengar Doaku." In both songs, the word "Saviour," which should mean "Juruselamat" in Indonesian, is translated as "Jesus." Similarly, in the Batak Toba lyrics, "Saviour," which should be "Sipalua," is replaced with "Jesus."



2. Differences

The analysis of the data reveals the most noticeable difference between the translated hymns in the two languages is the order of frequency in which the translation strategies are used. In the Indonesian hymns, after the adaptation strategy, the most commonly used strategy by the translators is TT (literal translation), whereas in the Batak Toba hymns, the second most frequently used translation strategy is replacement.

Furthermore, in the Indonesian hymns, the adaptation strategy is predominantly used in the songs categorized as "The Birth of Jesus and the Christmas Season," while in the Batak Toba hymns, the adaptation strategy is mostly employed in the songs categorized as "Confession and Forgiveness of Sins."

DISCUSSIONS

The findings of this research shed light on the translation strategies employed in the translation of hymns from English to two different languages, namely Indonesian and Batak Toba. The primary focus was to analyze the frequency and distribution of three translation strategies: adaptation, literal translation (TT), and replacement. The results indicate that adaptation is the most prevalent strategy used by translators in both Indonesian and Batak Toba hymns, accounting for 49% and 40.4% of the translations, respectively. This is in line with the findings of the study on hymn translation conducted by Purba & Setiasari (2022). This suggests that translators tend to prioritize conveying the essence and meaning of the original hymns in a way that resonates culturally and linguistically with the target language audience. The adaptation strategy allows for creative adjustments while maintaining the core message and spirit of the hymns. Furthermore, these findings reinforce the notion that adaptation is indeed the most commonly chosen strategy by translators when it comes to translating songs (Metin Tekin & Isisag, 2017; Metin Tekin, 2018).

Interestingly, there is a notable difference in the order of frequency between the two languages. In Indonesian hymns, after adaptation, the next most commonly used strategy is TT (27.7%), whereas in Batak Toba hymns, replacement (31.9%) takes precedence. This highlights the variation in translation preferences among translators working with different target languages, suggesting that factors such as linguistic structure, cultural nuances, and poetic traditions may influence their choices.



The analysis also revealed similarities in the translation of the term "Saviour" as "Jesus" in both Indonesian and Batak Toba hymns. In songs such as "Come to The Saviour/*Yesus Memanggil*" and "Pass Me Not, O Gentle Saviour/*Mampirlah Dengar Doaku*," the term "Saviour," which signifies "*Juruselamat*" in Indonesian, is consistently translated as "*Yesus*." Similarly, in Batak Toba, "Saviour," which is "*Sipalua*" in the source text, is replaced with "Jesus." This common translation choice is undoubtedly influenced by the cultural factors inherent in both target languages. From the researcher's observations, the term "*Juruselamat*" (Saviour) in Christian songs in Indonesian is closely associated with the Christmas atmosphere. This can be observed from the abundance of Christmas songs that incorporate the term "*Juruselamat*" in their lyrics. Similarly, the same phenomenon occurs in Toba Batakese Christmas songs. It is possible that this factor discourages translators from preserving the literal meaning of the word "Saviour" and instead opting for the use of "*Yesus*" (Jesus) as a substitute.

It is also worth noting that while the literal translation strategy (TT) appears less frequently in the overall translations, it is still employed by translators in both languages. The TT strategy allows for a closer adherence to the literal meaning of the source text, preserving its nuances and word choices. Although the literal translations may not align perfectly with the original lyrics in terms of structure and word selection, the core meanings of the whole songs are successfully transferred.

Further, the variation in translation strategies observed in different categories of hymns also provides insights into the translators' decision-making process. For instance, adaptation is particularly prominent in the translations of hymns related to "The Birth of Jesus and the Christmas Season" in Indonesian, while in Batak Toba hymns, the category "Confession and Forgiveness of Sins" sees the highest use of the adaptation strategy. This suggests that translators consider the thematic context and the intended message of the hymns when selecting their translation strategies.

Overall, these findings contribute to our understanding of the translation practices employed in the transfer of hymns from English to Indonesian and Batak Toba. The predominance of the adaptation strategy highlights the importance of cultural and linguistic sensitivity in conveying the spiritual and emotional essence of



hymns to the target language audience. The variations in translation strategies across different categories and target languages underline the dynamic nature of hymn translation and the need for translators to make informed choices based on the specific linguistic and cultural contexts.

CONCLUSIONS

In conclusion, this research highlights the dynamic nature of hymn translation and the importance of cultural and linguistic sensitivity in conveying the spiritual and emotional essence of hymns to the target language audience. The findings underscore the significance of adaptation in bridging the gap between different languages and cultural contexts, while maintaining the essence of the original hymns. Ultimately, this study contributes to the broader field of translation studies by shedding light on the strategies employed in the translation of hymns, offering noteworthy perspectives into the complexities of transferring religious and poetic content from English to Indonesian and Batak Toba. Future research can explore additional factors that influence translation choices, such as the religious and musical traditions of the target languages, as well as the reception and perception of the translated hymns by the respective communities. Understanding the impact of hymn translations on the religious and cultural experiences of audiences would provide further insights into the dynamics of hymn translation and its role in fostering intercultural and interfaith understanding.

REFERENCES

- Arrington, A. (2021). "Translated" or "transformed": the use of western hymns in the evangelization of the Lisu of Southwest China. *Religions*, 12(9), 1-8. Retrieved from <https://www.mdpi.com/2077-1444/12/9/772>.
- Iloimo, F. I. (2021). Hymns translated by Berlin missionaries in Southern Tanzania: some eschatological implications of translation. *Journal of Resources Development and Management*, 88, 27-36. Retrieved from <https://www.iiste.org/Journals/index.php/JRDM/article/view/57746/59630>.
- Kloppers, E. (2017). Hymns across the water ... translated and relocated: the perception of Scottish hymns in translation. *HTS Theological Studies*, 77(4), 1-7. Retrieved from <https://hts.org.za/index.php/hts/article/view/4500/9495>.
- Low, P. (2005) Song translation. In K. Brown et al (Ed.), *The Elsevier Encyclopedia of Language and Linguistics*. Oxford: Elsevier.



- Low, P. (2008). Translating songs that rhyme. *Perspectives: Studies in Translatology*, 16(1&2), 1-20. Retrieved from <https://doi.org/10.1080/13670050802364437>.
- Low, P. (2013). When song cross language borders: translations, adaptations and 'replacement texts'. *The Translator*, 19(2), 229-244. Retrieved from <https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/abs/10.1080/13556509.2013.10799543>.
- Low, P. (2017). *Translating song, lyrics, and text*. London/Newyork: Routledge.
- Metin Tekin, B. (2018). *An analysis of translation strategies and loss & gain in the translation of songs in Walt Disney animated musical movies into Turkish*. A doctoral thesis. Gazi University, Institute of Social Sciences. Retrieved from https://acikbilim.yok.gov.tr/bitstream/handle/20.500.12812/565505/yokAcikBilim_10199524.pdf?sequence=-1.
- Metin Tekin, B., & Isisag, K. U. (2017). A comparative analysis of translation strategies in the Turkish translation of songs in Walt Disney's animated musical movies: "Hercules" and "Frozen". *International Journal of Languages' Education and Teaching*, 5(1), 132-148. Retrieved from <https://eric.ed.gov/?id=ED574181>.
- Peck, M. A. (2022). *Prosodic modeling for hymn translation*. A thesis. Department of Linguistics Brigham Young University. Retrieved from <https://scholarsarchive.byu.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=10653&context=etd>
- Pluth, K. (2013). On hymn translation. *Usus Antiquior: A Journal Dedicated to Sacred Liturgy*, 3(1), 67-73. Retrieved from <https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/abs/10.1179/175789412X13184935045869>.
- Purba, L. P., & Setiasari, W. (2022). Translation method of English hymn song into Indonesian version in *Kidung Jemaat*. *TRANSFORM Journal of English Language Teaching and Learning*, 11(4), 219-226. Retrieved from <https://jurnal.unimed.ac.id/2012/index.php/jelt/index>.
- Tedeschi, N. M. (2019). *An exploration of musical influences throughout worship: enhancing worship experiences via hymns encompassing spiritual gifts*. A doctoral thesis. Liberty University, Lynchburg, VA. Retrieved from <https://digitalcommons.liberty.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=3120&context=doctoral>.